







Tools to assess the effectiveness of tourism plans and policies for improving sustainability

This document offers a two-step process to evaluate sustainability in tourism policies. Having a **CHECKLIST** is the first step towards analysing policies and ensuring that they include the needed criteria to tackle sustainability challenges. A second step is to ensure that the included criteria are being monitored. To do so, **INDICATORS** are needed. As such, this document offers a set of specific indicators that would help to evaluate the implementation of the sustainability criteria.

Checklist

Checklist to support the assessment of sustainability in binding and non-binding tourism policies at the regional Catalan level and local (county and municipal) level. The checklist can support the assessment of sustainability in documents that are already in place or are being created and regularly updated.

The person or team who wants to assess the sustainability of the targeted policy can go over the checklist with the aim to achieve as many "yes" answers as possible. If the analysed policy does not consider a specific "TO DO" stated in the checklist, it is crucial to, at least, bond the mentioned "TO DO" to other policies specifically tackling the topic and therefore, achieve a better understanding and interconnect tourism policies with sustainable principles.

Indicators (extended version)

Group of indicators to assess the effectivity of policies to build a sustainable tourism sector. There are two types of indicators. A "type one" indicator is assessed on a more basic level with a Yes/No reference scale. A "type two" has a more specific reference scale to measure the performance in detail. More indicators may be added as needed by policymakers or analysists.













Checklist to evaluate sustainability in tourism policies

PILLARS	TO DO - Does this policy	YES	In Progress	NO
Governance	integrate the concept of sustainable tourism?			
	include the 3 pillars of sustainability (environmental, economic, and social?			
	builds on the participation and decision-making of the quadruple helix actors (public authorities, private sector, society, academia) of the specific territory defining a communication strategy to work together?			
	clearly defines the governance structure and mentions the competent organisms for its implementation and funding resources?			
	follows diversity and gender equity principles?			
	establish a monitoring system with specific indicators?			
	take into account climate change mitigation and adaptation actions?			
	integrate biodiversity conservation and restoration programmes?			
ental	consider a sustainable mobility development?			
Environmental	tackle specific waste management strategies?			
Envi	involve the preservation of freshwater resources for drinking and leisure purposes?			
	include the use of renewable energy sources?			
	demand minimising light and noise pollution?			
	integrate actions to allow community access to material and immaterial resources?			
	prioritize the protection of cultural heritage?			
=	comprise local community engagement and capacity building action plans?			
Socio-cultural	incorporate guidelines to ensure locals secure living conditions and social cohesion aspects?			
ocio-c	take into account tourists health and safety programmes?			
S	penalise discrimination movements?			
	prioritize the quality of the service and transparency of taken actions?			
	consider spreading awareness and promote social and environmental responsibility?			
	include plans for fair working conditions and equal opportunities prioritizing local employment?			
omic	tackle stakeholder cooperation enhancing fair business competition and value chain capacity building programmes?			
Economic	integrate actions to move towards digitalisation and data sharing protocols?			
	inform on available funding programmes?			

Indicators to asess effectivity of policies to address sustainability in tourism

Governance

Topic	Multi-year destination strategy focused on sustainable tourism		
Indicator	Multi-year destination strategy that includes a focus on sustainable tourism targeting environmental, economic, social, cultural, quality, health and safety issues		
Definition		YES	
-	that is publicly available, is suited to its scale, was developed with stakeholder	123	
assessment	t, and is based on sustainability principles. The strategy includes an identification and of tourism assets and considers socio-economic, cultural and environmental issues and rategy relates to and influences wider sustainable development policy and action nation.	No / No data is available	
Topic	Territorial organisation responsible of managing tourism		
Indicator	An organisation has responsibility for a coordinated approach to the management of sustainable tourism		
Definition		YES	
The destinat	tion has an effective organisation, department, group, or committee responsible for a	-	
coordinated approach to sustainable tourism. This group has defined responsibilities, oversight, and implementation capability for the management of socio- economic, cultural and environmental issues.		No / No data is available	
Topic	Involvement of private and public sectors		
Indicator	The private and public sectors are involved in the organisation and coordination of tourism		
Definition		YES	
		113	
	al organisation group relies on the involvement of the private sector, r and civil society.	No / No data is available	
Topic	Organization appropriately funded		
Indicator	The tourism organisation is appropriately funded		
Definition		YES	
	adequately funded, works with a range of bodies in delivering destination management, o sufficient staffing (including personnel with experience in sustainability) and follows		
400033 1		No / No data	

is available

principles of sustainability and transparency in its operations and transactions.

Topic	Monitoring system and periodical evaluation		
Indicator	Monitoring system is reviewed and evaluated periodically		
Definition		YES	
The destination is implementing a system to monitor and respond to socio-economic, cultural and environmental issues and impacts arising from tourism. Actions and outcomes are regularly monitored, evaluated, and publicly reported. The monitoring system is periodically reviewed.		No / No data is available	

Environmental

Topic	Climate change mitigation and adaptation		
Indicator	Program to educate and raise awareness among the public, tourism enterprises, and visitors about climate change		
Definition	Definition		
	The extent to which a destination contributes to the sustainability and resilience of the tourism sector through public education on climate for both residents and tourists.		

Topic	Climate change mitigation and adaptation		
Indicator	Tourism enterprises involved in climate change mitigation schemes (%)		
Definition			
of tourism en taken part in	The number of tourism enterprises in the area involved in climate change mitigation schemes compared to the total number of tourism enterprises in the area. The reference scale is based on the number of organisations at a Catalan level that have taken part in the Program of Voluntary Agreements for the reduction of GHGs emissions compared to the total number of organizations in Catalonia. Through public education on climate for both residents and tourists.		
Reference s	Reference scale description		
+2	>0.044 % of tourism enterprises involved in the program		
+1	0.039-0.044 % of tourism enterprises involved in the program		
0	0.036-0.039 % of tourism enterprises involved in the program		
-1	0.033-0.036 % of tourism enterprises involved in the program		
-2	<0.033 % of tourism enterprises involved in the program OR no data is available		

Topic	Bio	diversity/natural resources conservation and restoration		
Indicator	Exis	tence of a land use or development planning process including touris	sm	
Definition			YES	
The extent to which the destination has a system in place to guide development towards desired futures, and to influence the location, type and density of development making special mention to tourism development. No / No data is available				
Topic	Bio	Biodiversity/natural resources conservation and restoration		
Indicator	Sus	tainability assessment of the destination		
Definition				
		n a destination assesses the direct and/or indirect impacts of their activities on biodiver and has a system in place to address them.	rsity and on	
Reference s	scale	Reference scale description		
+2		The impacts on biodiversity are assessed periodically, and actions based on the resofthe assessment are implemented	sults	
+1		The impacts on biodiversity are assessed periodically		
0		The impacts on biodiversity have been assessed occasionally		
-1		The impacts on biodiversity have never been assessed but plans and strategies to are being developed	evaluate it	
-2		The impacts on biodiversity have never been assessed OR no data is available		
Topic	Sus	tainable mobility development		
Indicator	Pro	gram to increase the use of low-impact transportation		
Definition			YES	
		n the destination promotes the use of transportation with a lower environmental ublic transportation and active transportation.	No / No data is available	
Topic	Sus	tainable mobility development		
Indicator	Tou	rists using public transport services to arrive at the destination (%)		
Definition				
		s that arrive to the destination by public transport compared to the total number of too ne ratio of foreign tourists that arrive to Catalonia by train or bus.	urists. The reference	
Reference s	scale	Reference scale description		
+2		>5.75 % of tourists using public transport services to arrive at the destination		
+1		5.25-5.75 % of tourists using public transport services to arrive at the destination		
0		4.76-5.25 % of tourists using public transport services to arrive at the destination		
-1	4.35-4.76 % of tourists using public transport services to arrive at the destination			
-2		<4.35 % of tourists using public transport services to arrive at the destination OR no data is available		

Topic	Waste	
Indicator	Program to assist enterprises to reduce, reuse, and recycle waste	
Definition		YES
The extent to which a destination works towards the reduction of the amount of municipal waste produced through the implementation of programs that support tourism enterprises in the reduction of waste production.		No / No data is available

Topic	Was	ste			
Indicator	Mu	nicipal waste production per inhabitant in a destination's high season			
Definition					
inhabitant. T	The amount of waste produced in touristic season compared to the amount of waste produced in low season in the area per inhabitant. The references scale is based on the average amount of waste produced per inhabitant in Catalonia. If monthly specific data for the destination exists, the reference scale should be based on the amount of waste produced in low season per inhabitant.				
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description			
+2		<1.23 kg of municipal waste per inhabitant			
+1		1.23-1.34 kg of municipal waste per inhabitant			
0		1.34-1.48 kg of municipal waste per inhabitant			
-1		1.48-1.62 kg of municipal waste per inhabitant			
-2		>1.62 kg of municipal waste per inhabitant OR no data is available			

Topic	Water use	
Indicator	Program to assist enterprises to measure, monitor, reduce, and publicly re	port water usage
Definition		YES
	The extent to which the destination implements programs to support tourism businesses to improve their performance with regard water consumption.	

Topic	Wat	ter use
Indicator	Incr	ease of the domestic water consumption in a destination with respect to zero tourism
Definition		
low season.	The re	e amount of water for domestic use consumed in a destination in high season in comparison with ference scale is based on the findings of Garcia C., et al. 56 on the assessment of water consumption sm in the Balearic Islands.
Reference s	scale	Reference scale description
+2		<5 % increase of domestic water consumption
+1		5-10 % increase of domestic water consumption
0		10-15 % increase of domestic water consumption
-1		15-20 % increase of domestic water consumption
-2		>20 % increase of domestic water consumption

Topic	Energy use		
Indicator	Policies and incentives to reduce reliance on fossil fuels, improve energy encourage the adoption and use of renewable energy technologies	efficiency, an	d
Definition		YES	
The extent to which a destination works towards the reduction of the environmental impact of energy consumption through incentivising the adoption of cleaner energy sources.		No / No data is available	

Topic	Ene	Energy use			
Indicator	Ann	Annual amount of energy consumed from renewable sources by the tourism sector (%)			
Definition					
The amount of energy consumed from renewable sources compared to the total amount of energy consumed by the tourism sector in a destination. The reference scale is based on values of the type of energy consumed at Catalonia level.					
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description			
+2		>5.75 % of the energy consumed is from renewable sources			
+1		5.25-5.75 % of the energy consumed is from renewable sources			
0		4.76-5.25 % of the energy consumed is from renewable sources			
-1 4.35-4.76 % of the energy consumed is from renewable sources					
-2		<4.35 % of the energy consumed is from renewable sources OR no data is available	<u> </u>		
Topic	Poll	ution			
Indicator		gram to encourage enterprises to follow guidelines and regulations to r light pollution	ninimize noise	е	
Definition			YES		
The event	ام: مارین		123		
		n a destination implements programs and strategies to reduce the noise derived from touristic activities.	No / No data is available		
Topic	Poll	ution			
Indicator	Noi	se levels at site in decibels			
Definition					
The noise emission levels (dB) in residential areas. The reference scale is based on the values for the Zone of moderate acoustic sensitivity of the Acoustic capacity map developed by the Catalan government.					

Definition			
The noise emission levels (dB) in residential areas. The reference scale is based on the values for the Zone of moderate acoustic sensitivity of the Acoustic capacity map developed by the Catalan government.			
Reference scale	Reference scale description		
+2	<57 dB (7 h – 23 h); 48 dB (23 h – 7 h)		
+1	<62 dB (7 h – 23 h); 52 dB (23 h – 7 h)		
0	65 dB (7 h – 23 h); 55 dB (23 h – 7 h)		
-1	>65 dB (7 h – 23 h); 55 dB (23 h – 7 h) and a plan for improvement is in place		
-2	>65 dB (7 h – 23 h); 55 dB (23 h – 7 h) and no plan for improvement is in place OR no data is available		

Socio-cultural

Topic	Community access to material and immaterial resources		
Indicator	Programs to monitor, protect, and rehabilitate or restore public access by locals and domestic visitors to natural and cultural sites		
Definition	Definition		
		123	
The extent to which a destination works to enhance the access of locals to natural and cultural key sites No / No data is available			

Topic	Con	nmunity access to material and immaterial resources	
Indicator	Acc	ess to tangible resources	
Definition			
		h a destination works to prevent and mitigate adverse impacts on local communities or to restore and ty access to tangible resources (e.g. water) and infrastructure	
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description	
+2		The destination has a programme in place to address the local community's access to tangible resources (beyond the requirements set in the local laws). Commitments, performance, improvements and effectiveness of programmes are disclosed publicly.	
+1		The destination has a programme in place to address the local community's access to tangible resources (beyond the requirements set in the local laws).	
0		No incidents of actual damage, adverse impacts or risks to the community's access to tangible resources have been discovered OR the destination has a system or mechanism in place to enforce the policy on the local community's access to tangible resources (in accordance with local laws).	
-1		Incidents of actual damage, adverse impacts or risks to the community's access to tangible resources have been discovered, but a corrective action plan with a timeline for completion has been developed OR the destination has a policy to ensure the local community's access to tangible resources in accordance to local laws, but does not have a mechanism or system in place to enforce the policy.	
-2		Incidents of actual damage, adverse impacts or risks to the community's access to tangible resources have been discovered, but a corrective action plan with a timeline for completion has not been developed.	

Topic	Cultural heritage protection	
Indicator	Program to protect and celebrate intangible cultural heritage (e.g., included drama, skills and crafts)	des song, music,
Definition		YES
The extent to which a destination implements actions to protect intangible cultural heritage.		No / No data is available

Tania	C. Ja		
Topic	Cuit	Cultural heritage protection	
Indicator	Exis	tence of aesthetic considerations in planning approval process	
Definition			
		n a destination has a strategy in place to monitor and protect aesthetic values, that includes tourism actions are being taken for this purpose.	
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description	
+2		Big efforts for a total integration and the beauty of the buildings/factory (care of the external parts, time, dedicated money, use of local and typical materials, etc.). Aesthetic integration can be considered fully implemented.	
+1		Some actions implemented and results are visible (some efforts to preserve the heritage, appropriate colours, greenery, appearance of the buildings/factory or adjustments beyond the regulations). Specific actions with regard tourism infrastructures are developed.	
0		A strategy is in place. Controls are in place to monitor aesthetic considerations. Projects are planned but not implemented.	
-1		A strategy is in place but projects are neither planned nor implemented. No controls are in place to monitor landscaped considerations, but is planned to start controls soon.	
-2		No strategy or action exists. No controls are in place to monitor aesthetic considerations.	

Topic	Community engagement	
Indicator	System for involving public, private, and community stakeholders in dest management planning and decision making	ination
Definition		YES
The extent in which a destination engages the local community in public participation processes for the planning and decision making of the destination, and takes their point of view into consideration on an ongoing basis.		No / No data is available

Topic	ommunity engagement		
Indicator	Increase of the number of cultural associations		
Definition			
the increasir of Statistics.	The extent to which a destination effort to preserve and promote culture through community engagement are reflected in the increasing number of cultural associations. The reference scale is based on the data provided by the Catalan Institute of Statistics. Each destination should compare the data at county level of one year with the year before by checking the information in the table (https://www.idescat.cat/pub/?id=aec&n=790&t=2021).		
Reference s	Reference scale Reference scale description		
+2	The number of cultural associations has increased more than a 5 % over the last year.		
+1	The number of cultural associations has increased over the last year.		
The number of cultural associations has remained the same over the last year.			
-1	The number of cultural associations has decreased over the last year.		
-2	The number of cultural associations has decreased more than a 5 % over the last year.		

Topic	Local capacity building		
Indicator	Training programs that provide equal access to decent jobs		
Definition		YES	
		TLS	
	o which a destination provides trainings to vulnerable population (including women, youth, ople, minorities, etc) to enhance their access to decent employment in the tourism sector	No / No data is available	

Topic	Loca	Local capacity building	
Indicator	Pro	Program to support and build capacity of local and small- and medium-sized enterprises	
Definition			
The extent i	n which	a destination dialogues, partnerships and develops projects with the local community.	
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description	
+2		Partnership and projects are robust implemented and running since the last 3 years. Dialogue is an activity with a defined frequency (>1 time per year). The destination has concrete plans for helping on the promotion of local events or local entrepreneurship and small businesses.	
+1		Some activity is already implemented and in place, and dialogue exists. Results of dialogue are recorded and are part of management decisions once per year. The destination participates on the promotion of local events or local entrepreneurship and small businesses.	
0		Some activity is already implemented and in place, and dialogue exists.	
-1		Some partnership and/or project is planned but not implemented still.	
-2		No information is available about the destination measures for involvement of the local community, no action started neither projects neither proactive communication.	

Topic	Secure living conditions	
Indicator	Publicly available crisis and emergency response plan that considers the	tourism sector
Definition YES The extent to which a destination has a crisis and emergency response plan that is appropriate to the		
destination. procedures a regular bas	No / No data is available	

Topic	Secure living conditions
Indicator	Proportion of housing available for touristic rental
Definition	
scale is based viviendas-va	which a destination ensures the access to decent and affordable housing for the local community. The reference don't he map developed by DataHippo (https://www.eldiario.es/economia/concentracion-airbnb-manzana-cacional_1_1961096.html) that presents the percentage of housing advertised in Aribnb between May and June pared to the total number of houses of each census tract.
Reference so	cale Reference scale description
+2	<0.5 % of housing available for touristic rental
+1	0.5-2 % of housing available for touristic rental
0	2-6 % of housing available for touristic rental
-1	6-10 % of housing available for touristic rental
-2	>10 % of housing available for touristic rental OR no data is available

Topic	Discrimination	
Indicator	System for improving the supply and visibility of accessible tourism servi with disabilities	ices for persons
Definition		YES
information about them to travellers planning and recoming their stays and activities		No / No data is available

Topic	Discrimination	
Indicator	Indicator System for reinforcing the inclusiveness of the destination	
Definition		
The extent to which a destination considers different types of customers such as families or individuals, or people with differ religious, spiritual or sexual orientations and works to ensure that no visitor is discriminated against for any of these reasons		
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description
+2		The destination has a robust system in place, that includes awareness spreading and education among tourism enterprises in this matter, to prevent discrimination against customers
+1		Actions are taken occasionally at the destination to prevent discrimination issues
0		No cases of discrimination have been reported
-1		Cases of discrimination have been reported at the destination and actions have been taken to solve the problem
-2		Cases of discrimination have been reported at the destination, but no action has been taken to solve the problem

Economical

Topic	Working conditions		
Indicator	Program to raise awareness among tourism companies' managers of the of offering stable and decent employment	importance	
Definition		YES	
	which a destination guides companies to improve their performance with regard their	113	
responsibility of offering stable and decent employment with fair and equal pay, full social security coverage, respect of workers' rights to organise and to bargain collectively, working contracts and gender equality, etc. No / No data is available			

Topic	Working conditions
Indicator	Jobs seasonality
Definition	
Unemployment variation as a percentage of the low season (October-March) with respect to the high season (April-September). The reference scale is based on unemployment data at Catalan level from the Labor Observatory of Productive Model of the Catalan government. Monthly data at municipal and county level can be retrieved from the same source.	
Reference s	cale Reference scale description
+2	<6 % increase of unemployment in low season compared to high season
+1	6-6.5 % increase of unemployment in low season compared to high season
0	6.5-7.5 % increase of unemployment in low season compared to high season
-1	7.5-8 % increase of unemployment in low season compared to high season
-2	>8 % increase of unemployment in low season compared to high season

Topic	Equal opportunities		
Indicator	Legislation or policies supporting equal opportunities in employment for women, youth, disabled people, minorities, and other vulnerable popula	_	
Definition		YES	
	o which a destination educates its enterprises to provide equal employment, training s, occupational safety, and fair wages for all	No / No data is available	
Topic	Equal opportunities		
Indicator	Occupation rate of persons with disabilities		
Definition	Definition		
disabilities a	o which a destination works to improve the quality of life and promotes the social integration trisk of exclusion through real and dignified employment. The reference scale is based on the th disabilities at a Catalan level.		
Reference s	cale Reference scale description		
+2	>32 % occupation rate of people with disabilities		
+1	29-32 % occupation rate of people with disabilities		
0	26-29 % occupation rate of people with disabilities		

24-26 % occupation rate of people with disabilities

<24 % occupation rate of people with disabilities OR no data is available

-1

-2

Topic	Local employment		
Indicator	Strength of policies on local hiring preferences		
Definition		YES	
The extent to which a destination has a strategy to spread awareness among tourism enterprises of the importance of employing local people to have a positive impact on the place where they carry out their economic activity, even if this includes having to allocate more resources to staff training.		No / No data is available	

Topic	Local employment
Indicator	Population employed in the tourism sector (%)
Definition	
Proportion of the population that works in the tourism sector normalised by the proportion of population unemployed. The reference scale is based on data at Catalan level.	
Reference scale Reference scale description	
+2	>13.5 %
+1	12.5-13.5 %
0	11.5-12.5 %
-1	10.5-11.5 %
-2	<10.5 %

Topic	Competitiveness		
Indicator	Program to promote sustainable tourism		
Definition		YES	
		123	
	The extent to which a destination has a strategy in place, involving the private and the public sector, to promote sustainable tourism among potential customers using marketing skills and techniques. No / No data is available		

Topic	mpetitiveness	
Indicator	ising awareness of tourism SMEs on the benefits of digitalisation and on existing ropean, national and regional digitalisation programmes for SMEs	
Definition		
tourism serv	The extent to which a destination provides to tourism SMEs skills and infrastructure to assess and integrate digital tools in tourism services not only to improve the marketing but also the efficiency and sustainability of their processes and encourage the development of innovative and improved services.	
Reference s	cale Reference scale description	
+2	The destination has a permanent system in place to aid tourism SMEs in the development of digital skills that can also involve economic support	
+1	The destination has a permanent system in place to aid tourism SMEs in the development of digital skills	
0	The destination has occasionally aid tourism SMEs in the development of digital skills	
-1	The destination does not have a system in place to aid tourism SMEs on their way to digitalisation, but they have plans to work in this line in the near future	
-2	The destination does not have a system in place to aid tourism SMEs on their way to digitalisation	

Topic	Stakeholder cooperation			
Indicator	Indicator Program encourages enterprises to purchase goods and services locally			
Definition	Definition		YES	
themselves t	The extent to which a destination has a program in place to encourage tourism companies to source themselves through local suppliers as a way of ensuring supply, support a stable local economy, and maintain community relations. No / No data is available			
Topic	Stakeholder cooperation			
Indicator	Indicator Increase of the number of companies in the destination			
Definition				
		number of companies in a destination compared to the previous year. The reference so ata at a county or municipal level should be compared against the reference scale.	cale is based on	data
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description		
+2		>2 % increase of the number of companies		
+1		1-2 % increase of the number of companies		
0		0 % increase of the number of companies		
-1		1-2 % decrease of the number of companies		
-2		>2 % decrease of the number of companies		
Topic	Eco	nomic profitability		
Indicator	_	ular monitoring and reporting of visitor expenditure data, revenue poloyment and investment data	er available r	oom,
Definition			V50	
	YES			
		a destination monitors the direct and indirect economic contribution of tourism and n is publicly reported.	No / No data is available	
Topic	Eco	nomic profitability		
Indicator	Dail	y spending per tourist (€)		
Definition				
	The increase on the amount of money spent per tourist per day on the destination. The reference scale is based on data of the average daily increase of international tourists spending at Catalan level.			
Reference s	cale	Reference scale description		
+2		>8 % increase of spending per tourist per day at the destination		
+1		6-8 % increase of spending per tourist per day at the destination		
0		4-6 % increase of spending per tourist per day at the destination		
-1		2-4 % increase of spending per tourist per day at the destination		
-2		<2 % increase of spending per tourist per day at the destination		

Topic	Quality of the service		
Indicator	Practices related to customer satisfaction, including results of surveys mosatisfaction	easuring custo	omer
Definition		YES	
The extent to which a destination has mechanisms for customers to provide feedback and monitors the results to improve its performance. No / No data			
results to improve its performance.		is available	

Tania		
Topic	Quality of the service	
Indicator	Average stay (number of days)	
Definition		
	The increase of the number of companies in a destination compared to the previous year. The reference scale is based on data at a Catalan level. Data at a county or municipal level should be compared against the reference scale.	
Reference s	Reference scale Reference scale description	
+2	>4 days	
+1	3.5-4 days	
0	3-3.5 days	
-1	2.5-3 days	
-2	<2.5 days	